A Critical Comparison of Educational Methodologies in Ancient Indian and Modern Systems with Reference to the Purusharthas

Prof. (Dr.) Devanandan K. V.

Principal, KPPM College of Teacher Education, Malappuram, Kerala

ARTICLE DETAILS	ABSTRACT
	This study compares ancient Indian education methodologies with modern pedagogical approaches, specifically examining learning outcomes related to the Purusharthas: Dharma (righteousness), Artha (prosperity), Kama (fulfilment), and Moksha (liberation). Analysis of Sanskrit texts and classical literature reveals that ancient Indian education fostered holistic human development through an integrated, value-based framework. The ancient system effectively balanced ethical, economic, emotional, and spiritual growth, contrasting with the predominantly materialistic orientation of modern education. The research suggests that incorporating elements of traditional Indian educational principles could enhance contemporary pedagogical approaches, promoting the holistic development of learners while retaining the advantages of modern education.

Education is a transformative process that shapes intellect, character, and behavior through systematic development. Ancient Indian education emphasized a holistic model of human growth, contrasting with the modern focus on intellectual achievement and career readiness. Rooted in the framework of Purusharthas—Dharma (ethical living), Artha (prosperity), Kāma (emotional fulfilment), and Moksha (spiritual liberation)—this approach viewed life as a balance of interconnected goals.

The Gurukula system embodied these ideals through personalized, value-based instruction where the guru served as both educator and moral guide. Learning emphasized self-discipline, character

formation, and inner transformation. Unlike today's often standardized, exam-driven systems, ancient pedagogy cultivated the full spectrum of human potential.

The Sanskrit maxim "vidyā dadāti vinayaṃ" ("Knowledge bestows humility") reflects this deeper vision of education—not merely as information transmission, but as a means to shape a virtuous and fulfilled human being.

"ācāryāt pādamādhatte pādaṃ śiṣyaḥ svamedhayā |

pādaṃ sabrahmacāribhyaḥ pādaṃ kālakrameṇa ca"

(Mahābhārata, Śānti Parva 318.39)

(A student learns one-fourth from the teacher, one-fourth by his own intelligence, one-fourth from peers, and one-fourth with time.)

Oral Transmission and Memorization:

Ancient Indian education emphasized Śravaṇa (listening), Manana (reflection), and Nididhyāsana (contemplation), supported by memorization. This layered process sharpened intellect, deepened understanding, and fostered spiritual insight.

Value-Based Curriculum:

The curriculum included the Vedas, Vedāṅgas, Itihāsa-Purāṇa, Dharmaśāstra, Āyurveda, Dhanurveda, Gāndharvaveda, and Arthashāstra. It promoted ethical, intellectual, physical, and emotional development, offering a holistic educational foundation.

Discipline and Character Formation:

Brahmacharya, beyond celibacy, emphasized self-restraint, simplicity, and focused learning. This disciplined lifestyle instilled humility, purity of thought, and respect for the Guru, shaping students' moral and spiritual character.

METHODOLOGIES IN MODERN EDUCATION

Modern education, shaped by Enlightenment rationalism and later industrial paradigms, is characterized by:

Standardized Curriculum and Mass Instruction:

Modern education uses age-based grouping and standardized curricula, limiting personalized instruction and teacher-student interaction, which reduces opportunities for mentorship, individual guidance, and emotional connection.

Emphasis on Cognitive Development:

Modern education prioritizes grades and test scores, reducing learning to measurable outcomes while neglecting emotional well-being, empathy, moral values, and self-awareness, leaving these essential aspects underdeveloped.

Assessment-Centric Learning:

Modern education emphasizes exams and grades, often overshadowing curiosity, creativity, and joy in learning, leading students to prioritize memorization over genuine understanding and critical thinking.

Technological Integration and Globalization:

Modern pedagogy uses technology and global content but often lacks ties to local culture, ethics, and indigenous values, causing disconnection from students' cultural identity.

CRITICAL COMPARISON OF LEARNING OUTPUTS

1. **Dharma (Righteousness and Ethical Living)**

Ancient Education: In the ancient Indian system, Dharma was the foundational principle guiding all aspects of education. Learning was considered incomplete without the cultivation of satyam (truthfulness), dayā (compassion), śīla (character), and tyāga (selfless sacrifice). The purpose of education extended beyond intellectual growth to include ethical refinement and moral responsibility.

"vidyā dadāti vinayaṃ, vinayād yāti pātratām |

pātratvāt dhanamāpnoti, dhānāt dharmaṃ tataḥ sukham"

(Hitopadeśa)

(Knowledge bestows humility, which leads to worthiness, wealth, and finally to dharma and happiness.)

Modern Education: Ethics are often taught in isolation, while commercialization and career focus promote a competitive mindset, neglecting empathy, honesty, integrity, and holistic moral development.

2. Artha (Economic Prosperity and Livelihood)

Ancient Education: In ancient India, Artha aligned with Dharma, promoting ethical livelihood. Education combined vocational skills with values like honesty and duty, viewing wealth as a means for righteous living and societal good.

<div align="center">

"arthaḥ saṅgṛhya dharmeṇa kāryo mokṣasya sādhanaḥ"

(Manusmṛti 4.12)

(Wealth should be earned through righteousness as a means for liberation.)

</div>

Modern Education: Modern education stresses career and economic gain but often neglects ethical livelihood, overshadowing purpose, meaningful work, and social and environmental responsibility.

3. Kāma (Emotional Fulfillment and Aesthetic Sensibility)

Ancient Education: In ancient India, Kāma was not viewed as indulgence but as a refined pursuit guided by śāstra (scriptural wisdom) and kalā (art forms) like music, poetry, and drama. Education fostered aesthetic appreciation, emotional balance, and cultural refinement, integrating joy, beauty, and emotional intelligence into the holistic development of the individual.

<div align="center">

"nāstyarthāt kamaḥ, nārthād dharmo 'sti, dharmeṇa hi kāmaḥ śuddhyati"

(Kāmasūtra 1.2.14)

(Pleasure should not be separated from wealth and righteousness; pleasure is purified through Dharma.)

</div>

Modern Education: Modern education's STEM focus sidelines arts and emotional intelligence, hindering empathy, self-awareness, and balanced emotional development in students.

4. Moksha (Spiritual Liberation and Self-Realization)

Ancient Education: The ultimate aim of ancient Indian education was Moksha, understood as liberation from avidyā (ignorance) and the realization of the true self (ātman). Education was a spiritual journey,

guiding learners toward inner awakening, self-realization, and unity with the universal consciousness, transcending mere worldly knowledge or material success. The Upaniṣads frequently declare:

"tad vijñānārthaṃ sa gurum evābhigacchet…"

(Muṇḍaka Upaniṣad 1.2.12)

(To realize the Self, one must approach a Guru with humility and desire to know.)

Modern Education: The concept of Moksha or spiritual enlightenment is largely absent in modern education. Modern education neglects spiritual growth, focusing on material success, which often leads to stress, unrest, and lack of inner purpose or resilience in students.

Holistic Development: A Comparative Framework

Dimension	Ancient Indian System	Modern System
Ethical (Dharma)	Core of education	Marginalized or optional
Economic (Artha)	Ethical livelihood	Commercial career focus
Emotional (Kāma)	Cultivated through arts and values	Underemphasized
Spiritual (Moksha)	Ultimate goal	Largely absent
Pedagogy	Personalized, experiential	Standardized, impersonal
Teacher's Role	Guru as guide and exemplar	Instructor or facilitator
Evaluation	Lifelong learning and character	Grades and exams

RELEVANCE OF ANCIENT METHODOLOGIES TODAY

- The ancient Indian model offers several insights for addressing the deficits of modern education:
- Integrated Curriculum: Inclusion of ethics, arts, and spirituality alongside science and commerce.
- Teacher-Student Bond: Reinstating mentorship models to foster moral and emotional growth.
- Purposeful Learning: Redefining success not merely in terms of income but in terms of social contribution and self-fulfillment.

CONCLUSION

While modern education offers technology and global reach, it often neglects inner growth. Ancient Indian education, rooted in Purusharthas, nurtured holistic development. Reintegrating its values can shape ethical, balanced, and awakened individuals.

REFERENCES:

1. Altekar, A.S. (2009). Education in Ancient India. Isha Books.

2. Bhattacharya, K. (Ed.). (1960). Manusmṛti with Nine Commentaries. Calcutta Oriental Press.

3. Cenkner, W. (1976). The Hindu Personality in Education. Manohar Publishers.

4. Devi, R. (2018). Ancient Indian Education System vs Modern Education System. Journal of Education Research, 42(3), 145-162.

5. Freire, P. (2018). Pedagogy of the Oppressed. Bloomsbury.

6. Ganguli, K.M. (Trans.). (1883-1896). The Mahābhārata. Bharata Press.

7. Mookerji, R.K. (1989). Ancient Indian Education: Brahmanical and Buddhist. Motilal Banarsidass.

8. Olivelle, P. (Trans.). (1998). The Early Upaniṣads: Annotated Text and Translation. Oxford University Press.

9. Peterson, P. (Ed.). (1887). Hitopadeśa with Sanskrit Commentary. Government Central Book Depot.

10. Radhakrishnan, S. (2009). Indian Philosophy (2 vols.). Oxford University Press.

11. Sharma, C. (2003). A Critical Survey of Indian Philosophy. Motilal Banarsidass.

12. Singh, P. (2013). Vedic Education: Philosophy and Method. Veda Mimamsa Research Station.

13. Thakur, U. (1974). The History of the Gurukula System. Chaukhamba Sanskrit Series.

14. Thapan, M. (2018). Contemporary Education Dialogue: Ancient Wisdom and Modern Perspectives. Oxford University Press.

15. Vatsyayana. (Trans. Doniger, W. & Kakar, S.). (2002). Kamasutra. Oxford University Press.